Sand Creek Massacre National Historic Site

2014 Metal Detection Sample Survey

By
Charles M. Haecker

With contributions by
Douglas D. Scott, Ph.D
and
Jeff Campbell, Sand Creek Massacre NHS

National Park Service
Heritage Partnerships Program
Santa Fe, New Mexico
Denver, Colorado
April 2015
Introduction

On September 22-26, 2014 NPS (IMR)-Heritage Partnerships Program Archeologist Charles Haecker conducted a sample metal detection survey of approximately 125 acres (the study area) within Section 13, Township 17 South, Range 46 West, Sand Creek Massacre National Historic Site. The goal of this survey was to identify physical evidence of massacre-related actions that reportedly occurred north of the Southern Cheyenne and Arapaho village site. The survey was successful in identifying patterned distribution of massacre-related artifacts. These findings broadly corroborate military documents and Native American oral histories regarding actions that took place within the study area.

Many people share in the success of this project. I greatly appreciate the pre-planning and in-field assistance provided by Alexa Roberts, Group Superintendent for Sand Creek Massacre NHS and Bent’s Old Fort NHS; Karl Zimmerman, Park Operations Manager; Jeff Campbell, Interpretations Ranger (Jeff is also a contributor to this report; see Appendix A); park staff members Karen Wilde (Tribal Liaison); Shawn Gillette (Chief of Interpretation); and Durwood Miller (Park Maintenance), who hustled to emplace guide lathe that kept the survey team “on the straight and narrow.” Assistance provided by Pecos NHS Curator Rhonda Brewer ensures that these relics of the massacre are preserved in perpetuity.

Tribal Representatives Joe Big Medicine (Southern Cheyenne) and Henry Little Bird (Southern Arapaho) were present in the event of a significant inadvertent discovery of human remains or other culturally sensitive artifacts. I also appreciate their personal insights regarding our discoveries of Native American artifacts.

Dr. Douglas Scott, who conducted the 1999 archeological survey of the Sand Creek Massacre site (Green and Scott 2004), conducted forensic ballistic analysis of bullets and cartridge cases recovered from this survey. His analysis results (Appendix B) are included in this report.

Of course, this survey could not have occurred without the metal detection skills and enthusiasm provided by members of Pike’s Peak Adventure League (PPAL). Crew members include Bob Dewitt, PPAL President; Lorrie Small; Richard (Dick) Lohr; Frank Polzin; Derek Egbert; Larry Glass; Cyril Smith, Jr.; Cyril Smith III; David Barnett; Misty Massey and Gary Massey. To each of you my heartfelt thanks for your outstanding work and friendship. Fair warning: I may ask for your help on a future project.
Natural Environment of Sand Creek Massacre NHS

The following Environment Overview text is excerpted in part from the National Park Service 2000 report, *Sand Creek Massacre Project, Volume Two: Special Resource Study (SRS) and Environmental Assessment (EA)*.

Sand Creek Massacre NHS lies in eastern Kiowa County, Colorado, approximately 180 miles southeast of Denver (Figure 1). The study area is within the High Plains portion of the Great Plains-Palouse Dry Steppe Province ecoregion. This ecoregion extends from northeastern Oklahoma north-northwesterly through Montana (Bailey 1994). The study area has gently rolling topography with elevations of approximately 3,960 feet along Sand Creek, and elevations of bluffs to the west more than 4,000 feet.

Sand Creek (also referred to as Big Sandy Creek on the USGS 7.5’ North of Chivington quadrangle) is an intermittently flowing stream that bisects the study area. Sand Creek is terraced, but mostly level to gently sloping and varying from one-quarter to one-half mile in width through the study area. Native American oral histories, period diaries and interviews, and period U.S. Army soldiers’ accounts describe Sand Creek as being similar to the current condition, with some notable exceptions. During the time of the Sand Creek Massacre very few small or stunted cottonwoods existed along the creek within the study area, compared to the numerous groves of large cottonwoods observed today. Cottonwoods are only successful where established during specific scouring and flooding conditions, nurtured by available surface or groundwater, and minimally disturbed by grazing pressures. Wildlife grazing by bison, wild horses and fuel wood gathering by Native Americans may have been primary forces that limited successful establishment and growth of cottonwoods throughout the nineteenth century.

Sand Creek drains the eastern side of a broad southeasterly trending valley composed largely of Quaternary aeolian sands. These sands from the Holocene and Pleistocene periods overlay complex and discontinuous sands, silts, and gravels from 0 to 70 feet in depth. Dune sands make up the bluffs along and extending back from the western side of the creek, while coarser valley fill and slope wash materials blanket the terraces and slope extending eastward. Numerous climatic extremes of wet, dry, and wind periods over thousands of years have modified surficial conditions to allow development of most alluvial and aeolian soils within the study area today. There have been severe dry periods recorded in the area during the last century, most notably during the 1930s and again in the 1950s. Local wind-caused soil erosion in eastern Colorado during the 1950s greatly exceeded that caused by the large dust storms of the 1930s because the amount of land cultivated by powerful mechanized farm implements increased during the 1940s and 1950s.
Figure 1. Location map, Sand Creek Massacre Site.
Vegetation: the primary grasses found in the study area are blue gramma grass and buffalo grass, accompanied by some switchgrass and side-oats gramma. Western wheatgrass is also found in the lower, moister swales. Where grazing has been excessive and on drier slopes, sand sage has gained a foothold. Trees within the study area are Plains cottonwood, found in even-aged groves close to current or historic seasonal stream traces of Sand Creek. At present, non-indigenous plants are not a large problem within the study area.

Wildlife: Large wildlife in the study area consists of free-ranging mule deer, white-tail deer, and pronghorn. Other mammals include coyote, fox, raccoon, badger and prairie dogs. Compared with some habitat areas in Colorado, the grasslands harbor relatively few bird species. The most common birds that are year-round within the study area include the horned lark, lark bunting, and western meadowlark. The burrowing owl and the great-horned owl are sometimes seen within the study area.

A description of the park’s natural environment including a detailed listing of its fauna and flora found be found at http://www.nps.gov/sand/learn/nature/index.htm, and in the 2013 report Sand Creek Natural Resource Condition Assessment, by NPS-Southern Plains Network Natural Resources (SOPN).

The NPS Sand Creek Massacre Study

In May 1999 the Sand Creek Massacre project team completed its successful search for the site of the Sand Creek Massacre (Figure 2). An archeological team that included tribal members, National Park Service staff and volunteers, and local landowners, found evidence of the Cheyenne and Arapaho village that was attacked by the U.S. Army on November 29, 1864. This survey capped months of multi-disciplinary, intensive research into the site’s location. As part of the site location effort, Cheyenne and Arapaho descendants of the Sand Creek Massacre told stories that had been handed down to them through the generations, including traditional tribal knowledge about the location of the site. Historians researched maps, diaries, reminiscences, and congressional and military investigative reports for information that might shed light on where the Sand Creek Massacre occurred. Historic aerial photographs, the earliest dating to the 1930s, were examined for evidence of historic trails that led to and from the Massacre site. Site location efforts also included a geomorphological assessment of Sand Creek, which identified via soil samples those specific landforms where 1864-era artifacts could be recovered.

As a result of these efforts, the 1999 project team conclusively identified the location and extent of the Sand Creek Massacre. Encircling a running engagement, this boundary extends approximately 8.8 km (5.5 mi) in length and 3.2 km (2.0 mi) in width. Key features include: the
Cheyenne and Arapaho village site; the “sandpits” area where the fiercest fighting took place; the general routes of Indian flight; and places from which Colonel John Chivington and his 675 men
Figure 2. 1999 Sand Creek Massacre Study Area. 2014 archeology sample survey is within Section 13, outlined in red.
launched their attack upon the village. A general reconstruction of these primary massacre events are described and projected onto plan maps in the National Park Service *Sand Creek Massacre Project Site Location Study, Volumes 1 and 2* (2000), and by Greene and Scott (2004).

Preparation for conducting the 2014 survey included a review of documentation regarding various actions that took place during the Sand Creek Massacre. This research focused on those actions that hold, or may hold, a direct association with the study area. Resultant information provided a basis for predicting where artifacts are likely located in numbers sufficient to reconstruct various actions that took within and near the study area. The following text is a brief synopsis of these actions.

The south boundary of the study area is situated approximately 0.4 km (0.25 mi) from the approximate northern limits of the village site. Both U.S. Army documents and tribal members’ oral accounts indicate the study area falls within the general routes taken by those Cheyenne and Arapaho who fled north, northwest and northeast from the village. Those who fled northwest followed upstream the Sand Creek streambed and adjacent floodplain/low terrace, with some making a final defensive stand at the “sand pits” area. Others who fled north from the village followed an unnamed drainage, which is located within the study area. Any who fled northeast and east would have traversed featureless, open prairie that lacked little or no natural cover.

Specific to the study area, the following text derives from information found in Appendix A, this report:

As the east flank of an envelopment attack, 1st Lieutenant Luther Wilson’s Battalion of 125 men, along with Major Scott Anthony’s Battalion of 125 men, headed to the southeastern side of the village. The 35 men of Company C in Wilson’s Battalion, led by 2nd Lieutenant Judson Kennedy, was detached to head further northeast, presumably to prevent any Indians from escaping from that side of the village. Military accounts are silent regarding Company C’s specific actions and the distance it covered as a detached unit. However, Kennedy’s post-action report indicates Company C suffered 40 percent/14 men casualty loss—the highest loss of any of the military units that were engaged at Sand Creek. Post-massacre accounts by Howling Wolf, George Bent and Edmund Guerrier indicate some 20 mounted warriors shielded those women and children who had fled northwards, presumably those who used the unnamed drainage as a flight route. Company C’s losses are attributable to defensive actions taken by these warriors.

Post-Massacre History of the Sand Creek Massacre Site

Three years after the Sand Creek Massacre, the Medicine Lodge Treaty of 1867 eliminated the Cheyenne and Arapaho reservation at Sand Creek; these lands were then open to settlement. By 1871 the area was well-known for bison hunting. Also by 1871, Hiram Holly had established the Holly Ranch (which later evolved into the SS Ranch) over much of southeastern Colorado, and
the open range cattle lands encompassed the study area. By the 1880s SS Ranch pasture was under fence, and the project area marked the western boundary of the “north pasture.” Barbed wire fences were taken down by 1885, at which point homesteaders began moving onto the pastures once controlled by the all the ranches. The earliest land claims within the study area occurred in the late 1880s, almost 25 years after the massacre. Union Pacific Railroad received odd-numbered sections in the area and were patented in 1904. Throughout the twentieth century the study area has been used for farming and ranching (NPS 2000, Volume 1:52-54).

Theorized Artifact Patterning within the Study Area

Given the above history of events, it was determined that the most likely locality within Section 13 containing Indian-related artifacts (e.g., cone tinklers, skinning knives, muzzle-loaded rifle balls, arrow points) would be within and/or in close proximity to the unnamed drainage. Artifacts related to Company C would include carbine bullets and pistol balls reflective of the types of firearms issued to the 1st and 3rd Colorado Cavalry regiments: .50 Maynard, .52 Sharps, and .54 Starr carbines; .36 Colt Navy, Remington and Whitney pistols; and .44 Colt Army pistols. A broad scattering of projectiles fired from these weapons would indicate the general location of the warriors’ defensive position as well as general line of approach and degree of intensity of Company C’s attack, relative to the main cavalry and artillery attack against the village. Presence of military-related items (e.g., uniform buttons, equestrian hardware, military issue firearm parts) would suggest hand-to-hand fighting, especially if intermixed with Indian-related artifacts. A widely dispersed scattering of massacre-related artifacts over a broad area would reflect a fast-moving, mounted warriors/cavalry fight. In contrast, little or no fight-related artifacts would suggest that Indian/cavalry confrontations were minimal or non-existent within the study area. Artifacts associated with late nineteenth-twentieth centuries ranch and homestead activities would include, as examples: Segments of barbed wire and baling/round wire, fence staples, period bullets and cartridge cases, farm-machine parts, and food cans.

Survey Methods

Given project time constraints, that is, five field days, it was determined that a ten-person survey team could sample survey approximately 25 percent/150 acres of Section 13. The unnamed drainage, including a narrow strip that borders both its sides, was the focus of the survey. Upland areas further east and west of the drainage corridor would be sampled once survey of the drainage area was completed. In fact, the field crew sample surveyed approximately 125 acres.

Applied survey approaches were designed to locate subsurface metallic objects using metal detectors. The surveyors also conducted visual inspection of the surface concurrent with metal detection. Metal detector operators furnished their own machines, which resulted in a variety of machine makes and models. Like models operate on the same frequency, resulting in signal interference at close intervals. It was necessary, therefore, to alternate different brands of
machines on the survey line to ensure adequate survey coverage. Metal detector operators were typically spaced 10 meters (32 feet) apart. Five-meter (16 feet) spacing occurred in areas where massacre-related artifacts occurred in greater density (Areas A-D) relative to the general artifact scatter pattern within the study area (Appendix D, Figures 5-8).

Detector operators walked transects oriented parallel with/perpendicular to the boundaries of Section 13. Daily composition of the detector crew ranged between nine and eleven detector operators who proceeded in line, using a sweeping motion to examine the ground. Each detector operator covered a sweep of approximately 1.5 to 2 meters (3 to 6 feet) depending on individual height and technique. Each subsurface metallic reading and culturally significant surface artifact was pin flagged. The detector operator excavated his/her subsurface target, then continued the transect survey. As detector operators advanced, the project director assigned a Target (T) number to each culturally significant artifact, and recorded its UTM coordinates using a Garmin Montana 600™ global position unit. Artifacts requiring more detailed analysis were collected. Each artifact was photographed in the field with a metric/inch scale, and then sealed in a Ziploc® plastic bag with assigned Target number, UTM coordinates, and date of discovery. This provenience information also was recorded on an artifact log sheet that included a brief description of the artifact. Collected artifacts were later analyzed in detail by the project director.

**Archeological Artifact Description and Analysis**

The sample survey identified a total of 48 artifacts, of which 45 were collected (See Appendix D, Figures 9-12). The artifact retrieval approach required judgmental artifact collection since many of the finds included late nineteenth-twentieth century ranch- and homestead-related objects such as barbed wire, baling wire, farm-machine parts, and food can fragments. For the most part, these objects were removed and discarded following guidelines stated in the park’s Scope of Collections. Artifacts of questionable identification or temporal span were collected for further identification and analysis. The goal of analysis was to identify the function and datable range of each artifact, in order to determine if it was associated with the Sand Creek Massacre.

Dr. Douglas Scott, a noted battlefield archeologist and leading expert in the identification of firearm projectiles recovered from archeological sites, conducted analysis of all of the conical bullets, the fired round ball that displayed lands and grooves, and the two cartridge cases. The project director conducted analysis of the six rifle balls. Firearms, in their discharge, leave behind distinctive metallic “fingerprints” or signatures, on the ammunition components. These signatures, called class characteristics, allow determination of the type of firearm, that is, model or brand, in which a given bullet was fired. This permits a determination of the number of different types of firearms used in a given situation.
Firearms Munitions

Round Balls:
One .32 caliber ball (T 42), fired. It was fired from a muzzle-loaded firearm such as muzzle-loaded rifle-musket that fired a buck-and-ball load, or was part of a buckshot load fired from a shotgun;

One .36 caliber Model 1851 Colt Navy pistol ball, fired (T 6). Navy Colt pistols were issued to the Second Colorado Cavalry;

One .41 caliber ball, unfired (T 27); intended for a muzzle-loaded firearm;

One .47 caliber ball, fired (T 23); fired from a muzzle-loaded firearm;

Three .52 caliber balls, fired (T’s 17, 41, 48); fired from a muzzle-loaded firearm.

The above-stated calibers of the muzzle-loaded firearms are reflective of trade rifles typically used by Plains Indians during the mid-nineteenth century.

.36 Caliber:
One conical pistol bullet, fired (T 44). The bullet was manufactured for use in the Savage Model 1861 six-shot revolvers. Since lands and grooves on this bullet are indistinct, it is not certain from what pistol model it was fired. It is possible it was fired from a Colt or Whitney revolver pistol. In fact, the Whitney is listed as one of the pistol types used by the Second Colorado Cavalry. The Savage pistol was intended only for military use. Between 1861-1862 the Union purchased some 12,000, and issued these to various volunteer cavalry units. Other Savage pistols were purchased through private means, and then shipped to the Confederacy. The United States Navy also purchased 800 Savage pistols (Garavaglia and Worman 1985: 69, 371).

.41 Caliber:
One conical pistol bullet, fired, badly damaged (T25). The make and model of the firearm from which it was fired is unknown, but it was not military issue.

.44 Caliber:
One Henry flat nose bullet (T 10), fired;

One Henry rimfire cartridge case with double firing pin mark typical of the Henry rifle, no headstamp (T 12);

One Ballard rimfire cartridge case, block firing pin imprint consistent with a Ballard, H (Winchester) head stamp (T 33). The .44-caliber Henry rimfire cartridge was developed in the late 1850s by B. Tyler Henry, the plant superintendent for Oliver Winchester at the New Haven Arms Company. The company’s name was changed to Winchester Repeating Arms Company in
the mid-1860s. Henry designed a double firing pin for his repeating rifle that would strike the rim of the cartridge at two points on opposite sides. Both the Henry Rifle and its improved version, the Model 1866 Winchester, had firing pins that were exactly alike in shape and dimensions (Garavaglia and Worman 1985:118-123).

Two Sharps bullets, variant 2-ring type (T’s 28, 29). The Sharps .44 caliber firearm was patented in 1852 and was a popular military and commercial firearm for the next fifty years. It was produced in both percussion and cartridge styles. Its popularity was due to its accuracy and its reputation for having effective stopping power (Greene and Scott 2004:126).

.45 Caliber:
Two bullets, fired (T’s 13, 45). These bullets were fired from a Colt Model 1873 pistol(s); therefore, these bullets post-date the Sand Creek Massacre.

.52 Caliber:
Four Sharps carbine bullets (T’s 19, 26, 31, 47), 2-ring variety; Civil War production. Patented in 1852, the .52 Sharps carbine was the weapon of choice in the pre-Civil War cavalry, and was the most accurate of the cap lock breech-loading arms perfected in the 1850s. The Sharps was the only carbine in actual production at the outbreak of the war. Around 90,000 Sharps carbines served the Union. Sharps also manufactured a .52 caliber rifle in limited numbers, and was the favored firearm of Union sharpshooter companies under the leadership of famed sharpshooter Colonel Hiram Berdan. Sharps carbines were issued to several Second Colorado Cavalry companies.

.54 Caliber:
One Minié ball with strong ramrod mark, likely from a dirty firearm (T 15). This firearm would have been a Model 1841 Mississippi Rifle.

One Starr carbine bullet, fired (T 24). Patented in September 1858, the early Starr carbines used linen or paper cartridges. Between 1863-1864 the manufacturer delivered more than 20,000 carbines to the government. Between March and May, 1865 the government bought an additional 5,000, which were chambered for the Spencer self-contained metallic cartridge, a major improvement over the separately primed linen type. In October, 1864 Colonel Chivington wrote the commander of Fort Lyon to request immediate shipment of a quantity of Starr carbines for use by his own troops. By November the First Colorado had turned in most of its muzzle-loaders and, as Colonel Chivington stated, was armed principally with “Star’s [sic] and Sharp’s [sic] carbines and revolvers” (Garavaglia and Worman 1985:197-200).

.58 Caliber:
Two Minié balls, fired (T’s 22, 30) from a Springfield U.S. Model 1861 rifled musket(s). The basic infantry weapon of the Civil War was the .58 caliber rifled musket. The Minié was a
cylindrical bullet with a conical base. The latter expanded at the time of firing, forcing the bullet tight into the rifling. Presence of these Minié balls indicates at least a few of the troopers were armed with Model 1861 Springfield rifled muskets.

One percussion cap, fired (T 46). The cap is of a size intended for a rifle or rifled musket.

**Arrowhead**

One arrowhead, wrought iron; 1.75 inches long, tapered stem; handmade (T 3). The arrowhead was cold-chiseled from barrel hoop or similar metal stock, then filed to remove chisel burrs and to produce sharpened edges.

**Military and Non-Military Accouterments**

One Model 1859-pattern spur with a small iron rowel (T 7). The heel band is bent out of shape.

One trouser cinch buckle, iron (T 14). This type of buckle was used to cinch or tighten the waist of uniform trousers since belts were not used on uniforms during this period. Buckles of this type were also used on vests (Fontana and Greenleaf 1962: 86; Legg and Smith 1989: 108; Scott 1994: 164). It is also possible the buckle was once attached to post-Civil War civilian clothing.

One copper tack rivet head (T 36). Such rivets would have been used on a variety of equipment including soldiers’ waist belts, belt loops, holsters, percussion cap boxes, bayonet scabbards, as well as on horse-related items such as halter, nose bag, and girth straps (Scott et al. 1989: 205).

One brass adjustment knob (T 37). The object from which this knob derives is presently not known. An observation made by Archeologist Jim Legg, an expert in Civil War military-related artifacts, is that the adjustment knob is similar to the one that secured the movable slider of a pendulum hausse breech sight used on Civil War era field artillery (personal communication, January 2015). Douglas Scott (personal communication January 2015) notes that, if it is from a pendulum hausse sight, it could have been lost as soldiers wheeled the howitzers through this area and up to the “sand pits” area, its eastern end located approximately 150 meters (500 feet) southwest and northwest from where the adjust knob was found. Scott also notes it is possible that the adjustment knob derives from a non-military mechanical device such as a mantle clock pendulum.

One button, pressed iron, 4-hole, 0.65 inch-diameter (T 40). Buttons of this diameter were used for securing uniform suspenders (Herskovitz 1978: 41).

**Personal Possessions**

Two tobacco pouch tags, pressed iron, circular, 2-pronged, originally enameled (Ts 18, 21). Tobacco pouch tags were introduced around 1870 (Campbell 1964:100-104; Storino 1995:5); therefore, these artifacts post-date the Sand Creek Massacre.
One boiler pot or kettle fragment, cast iron (T 38). The fragment has a raised “S” on its exterior, and is probably lettering of a manufacturer’s name or logo. Fragments of cast iron kettles, pans and Dutch ovens are included in the assemblage of artifacts recovered from within the Sand Creek Cheyenne and Arapaho village site (Greene and Scott 2000:148-149), the result of soldiers destroying Indian possessions after the massacre.

One awl, wrought iron, 5.5 inches long, tapered point at one end, chiseled point at opposite end (T 32). A wooden or bone grip, now absent, would have been at the chiseled point end.

One drift punch or spike, wrought iron, square head, 6 inches long (T 11). One side of the tool’s tip shows use wear, suggesting it was used as a wood chisel. The tool may have been an Indian personal possession deposited at or around the time of the Sand Creek massacre, or associated with late nineteenth-twentieth centuries ranching or homestead activities.

One tinned iron spoon, imbedded in melted lead alloy (T 20). The spoon handle is decorated with a triangle design. According to Mark Makenzie, Chief Conservator-Museums of New Mexico, this design is typical of late nineteenth-early twentieth centuries tableware (personal communication, November 2014).

One riverine igneous pebble with a naturally formed hole that extends through it (T 8) was found on the surface. This object may be a medicine stone or amulet, as suggested by Southern Cheyenne Tribal Representative Joe Big Medicine. If so, then it could have been a personal possession deposited at the time of the Sand Creek Massacre, or even associated with a much earlier Native American occupation within the study area.

One projectile point/scaper, lanceolate, one end absent (T 16) was found on the surface. Although non-diagnostic to a specific cultural phase, this artifact is similar in shape and size with other Archaic period (7,800-1,800 BP) lanceolate tools found in southeastern Colorado. The artifact was discovered within a 10 by 7 meter (30 by 21 feet) area that contains over 30 chert thinning flakes and a hammer stone.

**The Artifact Pattern**

Thirty-three artifacts are definitely associated with the Sand Creek Massacre. Of these, 31 comprise four artifact concentrations labeled Areas A-D (Figures 3 and 4). Two artifacts (T10 and T47), labeled as isolates, are also associated with the massacre and are located outside these areas. Six artifacts (T8, T11, T34, T35, T37, T39) also may be associated with the massacre.

*Area A* is located along the east side of the unnamed drainage. It is comprised of a .50 caliber ball fired from a muzzle loaded rifle (T2); an iron arrow point (T3); a .36 caliber Model 1851 Colt Navy pistol ball, fired (T6); and a Model 1859 military spur, bent (T7). Also within Area A is a pebble that has a naturally formed hole through it (T8), and may be a medicine stone. These artifacts are widely dispersed over an area measuring approximately 320 meters (1,050 feet) N-S
Figure 4: Location of artifacts associated with the Sand Creek Massacre. See Appendix C for description of each artifact, e.g. Target 12 is a .44 Henry cartridge case.
by 53 meters (175 feet) E-W. Although sparse in number, these artifacts together suggest a broad frontal attack by a cavalry unit, presumably Company C, advancing from the east against warriors positioned within the unnamed drainage. The bent spur suggests at least one trooper fell off his mount during this attack.

*Area B*, measuring approximately 350 meters (1,750 feet) N-S by 100 meters (320 feet) E-W, is located on slightly elevated ground that borders the west side of the unnamed drainage. Artifacts likely reflecting weapons possessed by warriors include: a .51 caliber ball fired from a muzzle loaded rifle (T17); a .52 caliber ball, fired from a muzzle loaded rifle (T48); a .47 caliber ball fired from a muzzle loaded rifle (T23); and a .41 caliber pistol or rifle ball, unfired/dropped (T27). Artifacts reflecting weapons possessed by the soldiers include: one .44 Henry cartridge case used in a Henry rifle (T12; it is possible this firearm was, in fact, an Indian possession); one .54 caliber Minié ball fired from a Model 1841 Mississippi rifle (T15; it is possible this firearm was, in fact, an Indian possession); two .44 caliber Sharps bullets (T’s 28, T29); three .52 caliber Sharps bullets, fired (T’s 19, T26, T31); and two .58 caliber Minié balls fired from a rifled musket (T’s 22, 30). A waist cinch buckle (T14), detached from uniform trousers, is also within Area B. This area indicates an action wherein four or more warriors fought a defensive action as they fled from the unnamed drainage after it was taken by the above-mentioned cavalry unit.

*Area C*, located approximately 240 meters (790 feet) west of Area B, is within a featureless open plain; artifacts are scattered over a 100 by 65 meters (320 by 213 feet) area. Artifacts include a fired .53 caliber ball (T41); a fired .44 caliber Sharps bullet (T43); a .32 caliber ball, unfired/dropped (T42); a .36 caliber bullet fired from either a Savage or Colt revolver (T44); and a fired percussion cap intended for a rifle or rifled musket (T46). A 4-hole iron button (T40), likely detached from uniform trousers, is also within Area C. This area likely reflects continued westward flight of an Indian group.

*Area D*, measuring 18 by 6 meters (60 by 20 feet), is situated on a floodplain/first terrace interface of Sand Creek. It is approximately 150 meters (500 feet) east of the eastern end of the sand pits defensive position located on the north bank of Sand Creek. Artifacts include one .44 caliber Ballard cartridge case (T33); an iron awl (T32); a cast iron kettle or boiler fragment (T38); two cut nails (T’s 34, T35); a brass rivet head (T36); a horseshoe nail tip (T39); and a brass adjustment knob (T37). The awl and kettle fragment are indications of an Indian presence along the line of Indian flight (Green and Scott 2004: 57, Map 8). The cartridge case indicates a military presence.

It is possible that the adjustment knob derives from a pendulum hausse cannon breech sight. Four howitzers (two of which belonged to the First Colorado and two to the Third Colorado) were brought up to the creek and, from positions on opposite sides, fired into areas of the occupied “sand pits” area. The howitzers were fired from several different vantages and at alternate times.
On one of his diagrams, George Bent places two of the howitzers on the north (east) side of Sand Creek, which is a short distance from the bank and southeast of the “sand pits” area (Green and Scott 2004:55). Area D falls within the general vicinity where Bent places these two howitzers.

**Conclusions and Recommendation**

**Conclusions:** Survey findings indicate three Indian defensive positions (Areas A, B and C). Area D is interpreted as a place where at least one tribal member briefly held a position and/or was killed, followed by soldiers whose presence may have included one or more howitzers. Overall artifact distributions within the study area suggest rapid movements over a broad area by both military units and a small group(s) of Indians. These Cheyenne and Arapahos included warriors who conducted rearguard defense while fleeing westward. Areas A and B together support oral histories that present the unnamed drainage as both a flight route and defensive position. Identified military firearm types are in keeping with what was discovered during the 1999 survey, and which support military records regarding what was issued to Colorado Cavalry units at Sand Creek (Greene and Scott 2004:124-132). Several warriors were armed with trade rifles of varying calibers and perhaps with one or more pistols, as indicated by two, non-military pistol bullet and ball calibers (T27 and T42). At least one warrior was armed with a bow-and-arrow. These artifacts also conform to what was discovered within and around the village site during the 1999 survey.

**Recommendation:** It is recommended that a sample metal detection survey be conducted within the eastern one-third of Section 13 to determine if mounted Indian/cavalry actions took place here, and if it was a flight route. The low terrace area within the SW ¼ SW ¼ of Sections 13, and the NW ¼ NW ¼ of Section 24 should be surveyed in similar fashion, in order to better define overall Indian flight routes and corresponding military attack.

**References Cited**

Bailey, Robert G.


Campbell, Hannah

1964 *Why Did They Name It...?* Fleet Publishing Corporation, New York, NY.

Fontana, Bernard L. and J. Cameron Greenleaf

Garavaglia, Louis A. and Charles G. Worman
1985  *Firearms of the American West 1803-1865.* University of New Mexico Press.
Albuquerque, NM.

Greene, Jerome A. and Douglas D. Scott
University of Oklahoma Press, Norman, OK.

Herskovitz, Robert M.
1978  *Fort Bowie Material Culture.*  *Anthropological Papers of the University of Arizona* 31.
University of Arizona Press, Tucson, AZ.

Legg, J.B. and S.D. Smith

National Park Service
2000  *Sand Creek Massacre Project, Volumes 1 and 2: Special Resource Study (SRS) and Environmental Assessment.* NPS Intermountain Region Office, Denver, CO.

Scott, Douglas D., Richard A. Fox, Jr., Melissa A. Connor, and Dick Harmon
1989  *Archaeological Perspectives on the Battle of the Little Bighorn.* University of Oklahoma Press, Norman, OK.

Scott, Douglas D.

Storino, Louis
APPENDIX A
Post-Action Reports, First Colorado Cavalry

By
Jeff Campbell, Interpretation Ranger, Sand Creek Massacre NHS
2LT Judson Kennedy’s Company C-1 at Sand Creek, 29 November 1864


On the afternoon of 28 November 1864, at Ft. Lyon, orders were given for the order of march to officers and troops for a night march to the location of a Cheyenne and Arapaho village on Big Sandy Creek. The column was composed of five (5) battalions [Bns.] of 1st and 3rd Regiment Cavalry detachments of companies. Within the 1st Regiment 1st Lieutenant [1LT] Luther Wilson commanded a Bn of about 125 men from elements of Co.s C, E & H. It is commonly referred to as Wilson’s Battalion or erroneously the “Veteran Battalion” It was not the Veteran Battalion, 1st Colorado Cavalry which was formed in mid-January 1865 from remnants of the old 1st Regiment Cavalry by District Commander COL Thomas Moonlight. Wilson’s Bn. has been designated as the “Veteran Battalion” because witnesses often refer to his command containing veterans which it did, to distinguish it from the other 1st Reg. Bn. MAJ Scott J. Anthony’s or the Fort Lyon Battalion, which was also composed of 125 veterans from Co.s D, G & K.

2LT Judson’s detachment of Co. C was composed of about 35 men probably carrying .52 calibre Sharp’s or Starr’s Carbines and .36 Remington or Whitney revolvers or .44 Colt’s revolvers. It is possible that there may have been a .52 cal. Joslyn carbine in the unit.

After a standard cavalry march of about 40 miles over about ten [10] hours from about 2000 hours to 0600 hours the column reached the Sand Creek valley. At a point about two miles downstream from the village scouts advised the commanders, COL Chivington and COL Shoup that the village was about two miles upstream. It was still dark at the time the commanders deployed their troops. The two bns. of the 1st were to lead the approach up the creek bed. Wilson and Anthony’s bns. led out at a cavalry gallop side by side in columns of four with Wilson on the left and Anthony on the right. Troops with Anthony recalled that Sand Creek remained on their right and Wilson on their left as they approached the village as the pre-dawn light increased. From the point of deployment to the Southeast perimeter of the village took about 15 to 18 minutes to cover.

Between November 23 – 30, 2003 I timed (Mountain Standard Time) a.) first sign of light, b.) daylight (ability to see detail like cattle at 1 to 2 miles), c.) sunrise and d.) sunset in Kiowa County. The following are approximated times of these events:

0530-50 hours first sign of light on eastern horizon, stars still visible
0605-10 hours DAYBREAK – bright enough to see about ¼ mile / 440 yards / 400 meters
0615-20 hours DAYLIGHT – bright enough to see details about 1 to 2 miles or light enough to see as in Day time.
0635 – 0650 Sun becomes very bright on ESE horizon. It is so bright prior to sunrise that one might believe it was actually "sun rise" or the point at or about the sun rising above the horizon at true sunrise.
0645 hours  some stars still visible

0650 hours  SUNRISE, about East Southeast [ESE] on horizon

(Official sunrise, about 0648 hours)

1200 hours  Sun stays low (about 35 degrees) above the southern horizon

1500 hours  Sun low, about 20 degrees or less above the WSW horizon

1600 hours  Sun very low

1630 hours  SUNSETTING, dusk setting in

Approximately 10 hours of Daylight

(Official sunset, about 1635 hours)

1745 hours  Twilight ends, full darkness, stars out

Soldiers in Anthony’s Bn. remarked that they were surprised to see Wilson’s Bn. gig their horses as they approached the village, pulling ahead of them and crossing in front of them then crossing the stream bed. Anthony’s Bn. lagged a couple minutes or more behind Wilson’s.

Once Wilson’s Bn. crossed the streambed they found themselves on the north side of the stream channel and at the SE perimeter of the village where several chiefs were coming out to meet them. Wilson deployed Co. H [about 70+ men] under 2LT Olney to within 75 to 100 yards of the village perimeter, while the 18 man detachment of Co. E under 1LT Dunn feinted to the left or south side of the creek bed and Kennedy with his detachment of Co. C went to the NE to capture a pony herd near the village in that direction. Not sure if Wilson went with Kennedy at this time or not, but they pushed the ponies back toward the village and the on coming troops. By this time, Anthony’s Bn. is crossing the creek bed and wedging itself in between Co. E to the left and Co. H already in line and firing.

3rd Reg. Command

Wilson to cut off ponies northeast of village

COL George Laird Shoup:

"Lieutenant Wilson, commanding a battalion of the first, was ordered to cut off the ponies of the Indians at the northeast of the village." Feb. 03, 1865 Deposition before LTC Samuel F. Tappan, in Denver before oral testimonies before the Military Commission.

CPT Silas Stillman Soule, Co. D:

"Major Anthony's battalion was ordered by Colonel Chivington to move across below the Indian camp to cut off a herd of ponies. Lieutenant Wilson, with a battalion of two or three companies, crossed the creek ahead of us, and opened fire on the village." Testimony before Military Commission, Feb. 16, 1865, Denver, Colo. Terr.  [ADH]

23
1LT Luther Wilson:

"The advance was made from the southeast side by the whole column." "The first firing was by our troops; I detached H company of my battalion, which was engaged some five minutes before the action became general." Affidavit to Commission on Indian Affairs, 05-25-1865, Ft. Riley, KS. [ADH]

2LT Joseph A. Cramer, Co. K:

"We had a fight. Lieutenant Wilson's battalion, consisting of parts of three companies of the first cavalry of Colorado, on our approach to the Indian village, made a charge for the Indian's herd, from one-half to a mile east of the Indian village, and drove their herd towards the village;..." Testimony before the Military Commission, Feb./Mar., 1865, Denver, Colo. [ADH]

***

"After driving the herd towards the village, Lieutenant Wilson's battalion of the 1st took possession of the northeast side of the village, Major Anthony's battalion took position on the south,..." Sworn, Ft. Lyon, Colo. Terr., 1865: Committee on Indian Affairs, Aka: Doolittle Commission [ADH]

***

"Our force was so large that there was no necessity of firing on the Indians. They did not return fire until after our troops had fired several rounds."

1865: Committee on Indian Affairs, [ADH]

***

"...and on approaching the village, Lieutenant Wilson's battalion took a position on the north side of the village and Sand creek, and immediately opened fire on the Indians. Major Anthony's battalion took a position on the southeast side, I should judge, and there waited for Colonel Shoup's Third regiment to come up, as he (Major Anthony) said he did not wish to open the ball, but wanted to see Colonel Chivington do so."

Testimony before the Military Commission, Feb./Mar., 1865, Denver, Colo. [ADH]

Cpl. James J. Adams, Baldwin's Battery, Co. G:

"... when we got down to where we could get a good view of the village the command broke out so as to surround the village; our company at the time was acting as artillery; we had two pieces along, with mules attached to them; we were left behind in the run; our mules could not keep up with the pieces; finally we got to the village with our artillery. The cavalry were around on the different hills firing at the Indians; the Indians had left the village ...” Testimony, Military Commission, April 04, 1865, Ft. Lyon, Colo. Terr.
Detachment – Co. C-1 goes to right of line for 2nd time.

At about this point then Wilson joins Kennedy and they move to the NE again in what appears to be an attempt to stage a flanking or enveloping movement east around the village which would cut off retreat or escape in that direction. Unfortunately the official reports dry up as a source of information and the rest of the day’s actions are condensed into short paragraphs, however there is an important piece of information which is Kennedy’s casualties that emerge from several sources. His unit takes a disproportionate high number of killed and wounded, upwards of about 40% plus. This leads me to believe that that unit, which experienced the highest number of casualties that day ran into a group of fighting men of either or both Cheyennes and Arapaho warriors who retrieved their horses and were able to stage an effective holding action against the flanking manoeuvre of Wilson & Kennedy. We don’t get much more about Kennedy’s movements until sworn testimony is taken during the military commission hearings in Denver and at Ft. Lyon in the Spring of 1865.

From the Cheyenne / Arapaho side of the actions we don’t have much information except in the recollections of Howling Wolf, George Bent and Edmund Guerrier from whom we can piece together some information. As shown in Howling Wolf’s ledgerbook drawing [used in the 2000 NPS Site Location Study] he and upwards of 18 to 20 warriors or fighting men were able to gather a like number of horses. Since it is effectively one scene in freeze frame we can only couple it with inferences from the topography and other troop movements.

Summary:

We projected that the Kennedy / Wilson skirmish occurred somewhere to the north of the village site or in the north-center of the field of action. We know that among the casualties was 1LT Wilson and the others enumerated below. We could expect to find cavalry gear, uniform parts, military tack and accoutrements as well as .52, .36 &/or .44 caliber rounds in the vicinity. We might also expect to find other horse tack although we don’t have information that horses were killed or injured in that fight. However, as a general piece of information we do know that horses were killed and died throughout the night. Since this was combat involving two armed and mounted groups we could also expect that the range of the skirmish was fairly large. From the Cheyenne and Arapaho fighters we could expect a wide diversity of bullets and metal arrowheads.

Alternatively, the skirmish probably wasn’t in direct proximity to the northern perimeter of the village, but out some distance. Also it could be possible that some of the more experienced and better mounted 3rd Regiment troops in detachments of Cree’s Co. A and Nichols’ [Boulder] Co. D moved to the right in a flanking movement during the initial phases. Some of the 3rd Regiment units following the two 1st Reg. Bns. would have arrived on the SE perimeter some eighteen or twenty minutes after the first volleys of the 1st Regiment and would have deployed to the right or NE then attempted to follow the 1st in an enveloping movement. It is also possible that once Co. H, 1st Reg. was forced to the right by Anthony’s Bn. wedging in between Co. H and Co. E, that some of that unit would have pushed to the north, but we just don’t have the detailed movements reported. An unfortunate gap in the record of the day’s events.
If we use the archaeological findings from the 1999 survey that points to the village site being in the proximity of the NE side of the creek valley in Section 24 paralleling and on top of the NE terraces of the valley, then Section 13 within the current site boundaries is tentatively a prime place to look for evidence of the Howling Wolf / Kennedy skirmish, however the range of action as noted, by mounted combatants could extend into Section 12, Section 18 and even Section 12 within the “authorized boundaries.” Also Kennedy doesn’t give us much as far as the distances he covered. Of particular significance in Section 13 upwards into Section 12 is an arroyo and some other depressions that could have been utilized as means of concealment for escape and evasion by dismounted non-combatants.


HEADQUARTERS Co. C, FIRST COLORADO CAVALRY

Camp, South Bend of Big Sandy, November 30, 1864.

COLONEL:

“... enroute for Fort Lyon, Colorado Territory, a distance of two hundred and forty miles, at which place I arrived on the 28th of November, 1864. I left Fort Lyon at eight (8) o'clock p.m. the same day, with thirty-five (35) men of C company, under command of First Lieutenant Luther Wilson, commanding battalion 1st cavalry of Colorado, made a march of forty miles to South Bend of Big Sandy, Colorado Territory, at which place I arrived a little after daybreak on the morning of the 29th, where we came upon a large village of hostile Cheyenne Indians, ... we immediately attacked; after which a general engagement ensued, which lasted until 3 o'clock p.m., in which the Indians were defeated and nearly annihilated; after which we returned to the Indian village, which we helped destroy, and then went into camp.

I had one private, Oliver Pierson, mortally wounded, (who has since died;) two privates, August Mettze and John B. Calhoun, severely wounded; Sergeant M. H. Linnell, saddler Elias South, and privates C. J. Ballou and William Boyls, slightly wounded. And I would most respectfully acknowledge to the colonel commanding the services rendered by my platoon commanders, sergeant John C. Turner and M. H. Linnell, and recommend them for their bravery during the entire engagement.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant.

J. J. KENNEDY, Second Lieut., 1st Colorado Cavalry, Commanding Co. C.

Colonel J. M. Chivington, Commanding Indian Expedition.


HEADQUARTERS CO. E, FIRST COLORADO CAVALRY,

Camp South Bend of Big Sandy, C. T., November 30, 1864.

COLONEL:
“... in the field November 23, 1864. I joined the column then in the field the same evening at Spring Bottom, ... I continued the march the next day under the command of Lieutenant Wilson, commanding battalion of the 1st cavalry of Colorado. We reached Fort Lyon, seventy miles further down the Arkansas, on the 28th instant, about noon. About 7 o'clock the same evening I started from that place with eighteen men of my company, taking three days' cooked rations on our horses, and travelled in a northeasterly course. At daylight we came in sight of a large village of hostile Indians, Cheyennes and Arapahoes, ... nearly two miles north of us. We immediately proceeded to the attack by moving down a small ravine and making a charge on the village from the north side, taking the Indians completely by surprise. They rallied immediately and the engagement became general, and lasted till afternoon, when they were utterly routed and half their number left dead on the field.

We continued the pursuit till 3 o'clock p.m., when our horses being much fatigued, and our ammunition nearly exhausted, we returned to the village, which we helped to destroy, and then went into camp for the night.

I lost no men killed and but two wounded. Sergeant Jackson had his hip broken, and private Mull was shot through the leg.

I am, sir, very respectfully, your obedient servant,

CLARK DUNN, Second Lieut. 1st Colorado Cavalry, Commanding Co. E.

Colonel Chivington, First Colorado Cavalry.

[Compiler’s Note: Although Dunn’s report seems to contradict my earlier statements about Co. E (detachment) movements there may be some details left out. This is an amazing report (total report about 300 words) considering the action lasted from about 0630 when firing began to about 1500-1530 hours or about nine hours total and other individuals, including Indian sources mention seeing “18” men on the west side of the field. However, using his report of “going down a small ravine to charge from the north side” may be consistent with early actions and not necessarily inconsistent with Kennedy’s report. What is really intriguing here is the mention of Sgt. Jackson who had his hip broken (from his horse being shot? And it falling on him?) Could the bent spur found just east of the arroyo (or small ravine) be Sgt. Jackson’s?). If this supposition is correct could the skirmish Kennedy’s men were involved in be further east and/or further north?]


WIA, hip broken at Sand Creek.

RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that "Win" possibly "Wm" Jackson, Pvt. Co. E, was wounded, thrown from horse and leg broken.

RMN, Dec. 12, 1864 ed., reports letter dated Nov. 29, 1864 received from "M" detailing events at Ft. Lyon from the 29th to Dec. 03, 1864. "M" attaches a letter from Dr. Caleb Burdsal listing Dec. 4, 1864 killed and wounded. W. Jackson, Co. E, 1st Reg. listed as wounded.

2LT Clark Dunn, Detachment Co. E: Report to COL Chivington. "HEADQUARTERS CO. E, FIRST COLORADO CAVALRY, Camp South Bend of Big Sandy, C. T., November 30, 1864. “ I lost no men killed and but two wounded. Sergeant Jackson had his hip broken, and private Mull was shot through the leg.” [ADH]

Dunn’s command may have ranged to west flank and been involved in fight with Big Head’s group. His command also reported on the prairie to the west.

MAJ Scott J. Anthony reports to Acting Asst. Adjutant-General "Captain" Joseph Maynard, with COL John Milton Chivington's Brigade, Indian Expedition. [OR, ADH]

HEADQUARTERS IN THE FIELD,
Battalion First Colorado Cavalry, December 1, 1864.

SIR: I have the honor to report that I left Fort Lyon, Colorado Territory, with detachments from companies D, G, and K; 1st Colorado cavalry, numbering one hundred and twenty-five men, and two howitzers, and joined Colonel Chivington's brigade one mile below Fort Lyon, at 8 o'clock p.m., November 28, and proceeded with his command, on Indian expedition, in a northeasterly direction, striking Sand creek at daylight of the 29th November, forty miles from Fort Lyon, when we came upon a herd of Indian horses, and I was sent forward with my battalion to capture stock. After proceeding about one mile [mile 41] we came in sight of an Indian camp, some two miles [mile 43] further. I immediately sent word to the colonel commanding that an Indian camp was in sight, and proceeded with my command in the direction of the camp, which I reached just before sunrise. I found Lieutenant Wilson, with a detachment of 1st Colorado cavalry, upon the right and south of the camp, and Lieutenant Dunn, with a detachment of 1st Colorado cavalry, posted upon the west bank of Sand creek, and opposite the camp, both commands keeping up a brisk fire upon the camp.

The loss to my command was one killed and three wounded. The loss to the entire command, ten killed and forty wounded. Lieutenant Baldwin, commanding the section of howitzers, attached to my battalion, had a fine private horse shot from under him. Seven horses were killed in my command. The loss to the Indians was about three hundred killed, some six hundred ponies, and one hundred and thirty lodges, with a large quantity of buffalo robes, and their entire camp equipage.

The camp proved to be Cheyenne and Arapahoe Indians, ...

SCOTT J. ANTHONY, Major First Colorado Cavalry, Commanding Battalion.

A. A. A. General, Colonel Chivington's Brigade, Indian Expedition.

Ft. Lyon, C.T.

December 14, 1864

[The more likely date for this letter is Dec. 19th same as Cramer’s letter since at the end of this letter Soule states Tappan leaves by the morning stage for Denver. Further information show Tappan arrives at Denver on the 22nd allowing for about 2.5 or 3 days stage travel to Denver.]

Dear Ned: [Major Edward Wynkoop]

“... I was then ordered with my whole company to Major A—with 20 days rations. I told him that I would not take part in their intended murder, but if they were going after the Sioux, Kiowa's or any fighting Indians, I would go as far as any of them. They said that was what they were going for, and I joined them. We arrived at Black Kettles and Left Hand's Camp at day light. Lieut. Wilson with Co's C, E & G were ordered in advance to cut off their herd. ... The massacre lasted six or eight hours, [about 1200 to 1400 hours] and a good many Indians escaped. ... Some tried to escape on the Prairie, but most of them were run down by horsemen. ...

Yours sc. ss S. S. Soule [Captain Silas S. Soule]

" ... Wilson [1LT Luther Wilson] (who was wounded in the arm) start for Denver in the morning. ..."

[from Denver Rocky Mountain News, Deborah Frazier "The Sand Creek Massacre Letters", Friday 15 September, 2000. at member.tripod.com/wynkoop/webdocs/sndcrklt.htm Photocopy photographed Steve Peterson, Special to the News] [These articles appear all over the internet and through links to various sites.]

Text also appears in Winter 2001 edition of Colorado Heritage. Although I have not seen the entire cursive or handwritten text / original it appears that several landmark letters in the script are written by the same hand in Soule's and Cramer's letters, which I have been told by reliable sources were reportedly "copies" or "field copies" as was the custom in the days, probably created by an orderly or clerk at Fort Lyon and then distributed. The modern reader should place this into the context of the days before carbon paper, mimeographs and copiers.]

Second Report of COL Chivington to MG Samuel R. Curtis. [OR, ADH]

[Some minor discrepancies between copy submitted to Joint Committee and Official Records. Interestingly the copy submitted to the Joint Committee does not contain the last full paragraph of the report addressing CPT Silas Soule's conduct nor the "evidence" of the Indians' crimes found in the village.]
HEADQUARTERS DISTRICT OF COLORADO,

Denver, C. T., December 16, 1864

GENERAL: “... on the morning of the 28th ["ultimo" in OR] arrived at Fort Lyon, ... I resumed my march, being joined by Major Scott J. Anthony, 1st cavalry of Colorado, with one hundred and twenty-five men of said regiment, consisting of detachments of companies D, G and K, with two howitzers. The command then proceeded in a northeasterly direction, traveling all night, and at daylight of the 29th November striking Sand creek about forty (40) miles from Fort Lyon.

Here was discovered an Indian village of one hundred and thirty (130) lodges composed of Black Kettle's band of Cheyennes and eight (8) lodges of Arapahoes, with Left Hand. My line of battle was formed with Lieutenant Wilson's battalion of the 1st regiment, numbering about 125 men, on the right, Colonel Shoup's 3rd regiment, numbering about 450 men, in the centre, and Major Anthony's battalion, numbering 125 men, 1st regiment, on the left.

The attack was immediately made upon the Indian's camp by Lieutenant Wilson's, who dashed forward, cutting the enemy off from their herd, and driving them out of their camp, ...”

The Indians, ..., though taken by surprise, speedily rallied and formed a line of battle across the creek, about three-fourths of a mile above the village, stubbornly contesting every inch of ground.

The commands of Colonel Shoup and Major Anthony pressed rapidly forward and attacked the enemy sharply, and the engagement became general, we constantly driving the Indians, who fell back from one position to another for five miles, and finally abandoned resistance and dispersed in all directions and were pursued by my troops until nightfall.

“... Major Anthony, Lieutenant Wilson and Lieutenant Clark Dunn, upon whom the command devolved after the disability of Lieutenant Wilson from wounds received.

“... For full particulars and reports of the several commanders I respectfully refer you to the following copies herewith enclosed, of Colonel George L. Shoup, 3d regiment, December 6, 1864; Colonel Shoup, 3d regiment, December 7, 1864; ["Lieutenant Colonel" in OR] Colonel L. L. Bowen, 3d regiment, November 30, 1864; Major Hal Sayr, 3d regiment, December 6, 1864; ["Capt. Theodore G. Cree, Third Regiment, December 6, 1864;" in OR] Major Scott J. Anthony, 1st regiment, December 1, 1864; Lieutenant Clark Dunn, 1st regiment, November 30, 1864; Lieutenant J. J. Kennedy, November 30, 1864.

... very respectfully, your obedient servant, J. M. CHIVINGTON

Col. 1st Cavalry of Colorado, Commanding District of Colorado.

[In OR version the addressed party reads:

"Maj. Gen. S. R. Curtis, Commanding Department of Kansas, Fort Leavenworth."]
[Same source, as Soule’s letter above, plus in 2014 the copies of the actual “field copies” were found again, buried in publications files at the CHS [now known as “History Colorado”]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Co</th>
<th>KIA</th>
<th>WIA</th>
<th>#Present</th>
<th>Location/Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CPT</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT E.A. Jacob’s</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1LT Kennedy’s</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT Soule’s</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1LT Dunn’s Det.</td>
<td>E</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT Cook’s</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>unk.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baldwin’s Btry.</td>
<td>G</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>unk. [40?]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1LT Wilson’s</td>
<td>H</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>70+</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT Kerber’s</td>
<td>I</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2LT Cramer’s</td>
<td>K</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>44?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT Backus’</td>
<td>L</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>[2]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPT Hardy’s</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2011 Totals 7 20 250

LT Kennedy’s detachment of Co. C remains the highest casualty rate on the field at about 43%. The 1st Regiment casualty rate was about 10%. Based on an analysis of the actions on the field that day at Sand Creek it is very possible that early in the action after Co. C chased after the horse herds and came back toward the northern end of the village they were met by a concentrated force of defenders, possibly in the center of the field north of the village, as is described by Howling Wolf in his ledger book drawings from the prison camp at Ft. Marion in Florida. 1LT Luther Wilson was with that group of soldiers and was also seriously wounded and had to be taken from the field early in the day.
1st Regiment units as organized for Indian Expedition, November 28, 1864 from records:

Company C – detachment, 35 men and horses

Probably armed with Starr’s or Sharps’ Carbines, cal. .52 and Remington .36 cal. or Colt’s .44 cal. revolvers.

2LT Judson J. Kennedy  Commanding detachment.
Sergeant John C. Turner  Platoon commander
Sergeant Marshal H. Linnell  Platoon commander    WIA

KNOWN TO HAVE BEEN AT SAND CREEK

The rolls:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Last Name/ First Name/Aliases</th>
<th>Rank</th>
<th>Company Assignment</th>
<th>At Sand Creek</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ss Ballou, Cornelius J.</td>
<td>3rd Duty Sgt., 3rd Cpl., Pvt.</td>
<td>C,D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Identified in SLS as witness. OR, WIA Sand Creek. WIA, slightly.

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]

Name: Ballou, C. J. or Cornelius J.  Variant Spelling: Cornelius J. Ballon w/ rank of Bugler


Enlisted at & date: Buckskin Joe, Sept. 2, 1861

Issue: Aug. 13, 1862, Sgt., Co. C  Witness: 2LT Clark Dunn

Issue: Dec. 28, 1864, noted as Pvt. [demotion?]

Issue: Jan. 8, 1865  Issue: June 2, 1865  Witness: J. C. Turner, 1SGT, Co. D

Issue: Sept., 10, 1865  Witness: J. C. Turner, 1SGT, Co. D

Remarks: ss Cornelius J. Ballou

Riverside Cemetery, Denver, CO, Sat., Jan. 17, 2009:

Cornelius Ballou, Co. D, 1 Colo. Cav., original stone
The Sand Creek Affair- A General Outbreak of the Indians in 1864 Created a Reign of Terror in Colorado. [This article appears to have been written by a third party interviewer / writer about Ballou and with quotes.]

“One of the battles which occurred during the period of the civil war, and about which little has been said or written, is known as “The Sand Creek Affair.” This was a fight between United States troops and Indians, and not a massacre of the red men, as has been erroneously stated by some persons. It occurred Nov. 27, 1864 [sic], in what was known as the Sand Creek region of Colorado.

An account of the fight has been prepared for The National Tribune by Comrade Cornelius J. Ballou of the Soldiers’ Home at Montevista, Colo., who was a participant in the battle and is today a cripple as a result of wounds he received in that action. Comrade Ballou was at the time a member of the 1st Colo. Cav., and while charging the Indians succeeded in stopping two of their arrows, one of which pierced his right kidney.

“The fortified place of the Indians on Sand Creek was about 40 miles west of the dividing line between Colorado and Kansas. [Have found no substantive information that the trenches were other than hastily thrown up sand banks in the stream channel by women and children and elderly.]

“... Some 1st Reg. troops under 1LT Wilson, numbering about 120 or more, incl. Co. C, accompanied Chivington’s Indian Expedition to rendezvous at Camp Fillmore.] These were all concentrated at Fort Lyon, and about sunset [sic] of Nov. 28, 1864, the command started for the Indian camp, preceded by guides and scouts [plural is correct, at least 8-13 scouts], ...

“the cavalcade rode until the first streaks of day appeared in the east, when the scouts came in and reported that the Indian camp was in sight. [Evidence supports this statement about the scouts.] The command was halted and the battalion of the old 1st Colo. Cav. was ordered to take the lead. [Along with Ft. Lyon Bn. of the 1st.] Then came the order “Trot,” quickly followed by “Gallop” and “Charge!” [This last command may have been issued to 1LT Wilson’s battalion as the Ft. Lyon Bn. witnesses recall that Bn. pulling ahead of them and crossing the creek minutes before them still at a gallop.]

“... We charged in and cut them off from their ponies and they broke and ran for their fortifications, 200 or 800 yards further up the creek.

“... wounded, including myself. One arrow, after going through my carbine sling, punctured my kidney. [Oddly, Ballou isn’t listed in any of the casualty reports.]

Batton, James C WIA/SC
RMN, Dec. 12, 1864 ed., reports letter dated Nov. 29, 1864, received from "M" detailing events at Ft. Lyon from the 29th to Dec. 03, 1864. "M" attaches a letter from Dr. Caleb Burdsal listing
Dec. 4, 1864 killed and wounded. James Batton, Co. C, 1st Reg. listed as wounded. Not found as such in CSA or other rosters. Possible James Barnett, Co. G?

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR] No records noted.

Boyles, Bailes, Boiles, Boils or Boyls, William  Pvt. D,C WIA/SC


“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]


Enlisted at & date: Sept. 28, 1864 at Denver City

Issue: Dec. 1864 Remarks: Settled on Dec. 31, 1864

Issue: Jan. 8, 1865 [Would have been reassigned to reorganised Vet. Bn., Co. D]

Issue: Jun 2, 1865 Witness: J. C. Turner, 1SGT, Co. D

Issue: Sept. 10, 1865 Witness: J. C. Turner, 1SGT, Co. D

Calhoun, Cahoon, John B. or John C.  Pvt. C, D WIA/SC

John B. Calhoun "severely" WIA SC.

RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that "James Calhoun, Company C," was wounded, in right leg, with arrow, slight. No "James Calhoun" on rosters. Calhoun is also listed as "J. B. Calhoun"

Also RMN lists "J. B. Calhoun" Co. C as wounded with gunshot wound to the throat, serious. RMN, Dec. 28, 1864 ed. prints Dec. 10, 1864 letter from soldiers recuperating at the Ft. Lyon Hospital. One of those who signed the letter was "John B. Calhoun, Co. C, 1st Cavalry."

RMN, Dec. 12, 1864 ed., reports letter dated Nov. 29, 1864 received from "M" detailing events at Ft. Lyon from the 29th to Dec. 03, 1864. "M" attaches a letter from Dr. Caleb Burdsal listing Dec. 4, 1864 killed and wounded. John B. Calhoun, Co. C, 1st Reg. listed as wounded.

Co.

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]

Name: Calhoun, John B. Rank: Pvt. Company: C

Enlisted at & date: Sept. 2, 1861 at Hamilton, C. T.

Issue: Aug. 13, 1862 Witness: 2LT Clark Dunn Issue: Dec. 2, 1864
Cramer, John  Pvt., Sgt., 1st Cpl., C, D Possibly at SC

“Source: The serial numbers and names listed here can be found in the Company Order Book of Co. D.”  [SHARPS]

John Cramer, enlisted as Pvt. at Buckskin Joe, by LT Chambers, Sept. 7, 1861 [RDB1CO]

Age: 23, b. 1838, 5’ 5”, grey eyes, light hair, light complx., at Syracuse, NY

Occupation: Shoemaker. Scar on right eye


On September 29, 2008 I observed the headstones for Joseph A. Cramer and N. Augusta Cramer at the Prairie Mound Cemetery at Solomon, KS. There I saw a Civil War military stone, which was just east of the stones mentioned, and it was inscribed “J. J. Cramer, Co. C 1st Colo. Cav.” It could be possible this is the stone for this soldier and perhaps they were brothers or relatives buried in the same plot. A review of cemetery records revealed no further information.

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]


Enlisted at & date: Sept. 7, 1861 at Buckskin Joe

Issue: Aug. 13, 1862 as Cpl.  Witness: 2LT Clark Dunn

Issue: Dec. 28, 1864 as Sgt.  Remarks: Settled Dec. 31, 1864

Issue: Jan. 8, 1865 as Sgt. Co. C Issue: Mar. 7, 1865

Issue: Jun. 2, 1865  Witness: 1SGT J. C. Turner

Issue: Jul. 14, 1865  Witness: 1SGT J. C. Turner
Dorsey, or Dorcus, Samuel C.  Pvt., Cpl.  C  SC

DPL/WHC, Vol. 4, Cragin Index: Sept. 12, 1903, Milo H. Slater, “came to Colo. in 1860; was in the Sand Creek fight. ? notes; ... Dorsey, Claim Agt Denver Tramway Co. was in Sand Cr. fight

DPL/WHC microfilms, Re; George Washington Pingree

The Denver Post, Saturday, March 4, 1911, p. 8

“Scout Who Scalped 13 Indians At Sand Creek, now 84 Years Old, Is In Denver”

“George Pingree, a Dare-Devil Fighter, in Colorado Nearly Fifty Years Ago”

Mr. Pingree carefully combed his whiskers aside, and displayed a scar nearly an inch long. Then he continued his story:

“... I didn’t have time to pull that arrow out of my face, but ran with it hanging there. Other arrows just whistled around me, and several of them cut my clothes. But there must be some sort of special providence for chaps like myself, for I didn’t get hit again.

“When I reached our lines I was about all in, and I didn’t have strength enough to pull out that arrow. Sam Dorsey, who is now claim agent for the Denver Tramway company was close to me, and he pulled the arrow out. Sam was just a young boy then, but he was mighty game, I can tell you that.

The Trail, v. VII, January 1914, The Passing of the Pioneer

Mrs. Mary E. Sanford [Aka: Mollie Dorsey Sanford]

One of Colorado’s oldest women pioneers, died at her home, 39 East Second avenue, December last. Mrs. Sanford was born in Indiana in 1838. She was married in 1860 to Byron N. Sanford, and left home immediately to start on a 600-mile journey westward, traveling across the plains during the Indian troubles. Later she shared the hardships of her husband in his search for gold in Colorado and when Mr. Sanford was made a commissioned officer in the First Colorado regiment by Gov. William Gilpin, Mrs. Sanford accompanied him to Fort Lyons [sic]. She witnessed the Cherry creek flood in 1864, and the following year was forced to move from the homestead near Littleton to Denver to escape the raids of Arapahoe [?] Indians. At the death of her aged husband last Thanksgiving Mrs. Sanford declared she would follow soon. She is survived by a son and a daughter, Albert B. Sanford and Mrs. A. H. Williams; two sisters, Mrs. Harris and Mrs. Slaughter, and two brothers, W. F. Dorsey and Sam C. Dorsey [served in the 1st Reg. and at SC. There are two Dorseys with the first initial W in the 1st Reg. as well.]

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]

Name: Dorsey, Samuel C.  Rank: Pvt.  Company: C

Enlisted at & date: Oct. 1, 1863 at Denver
Eaton, Joe
Pvt. C WIA/SC
Not on CSA and other rolls / rosters.
RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that Joe Eaton, Pvt. Co. C, was wounded, arrow in small of back. Not found on rosters. Could be Charles “Joe” Eaton above.

Elements of both Co. C under 2LT Judson Kennedy and Co. K under 2LT Joseph Cramer were at SC. Kennedy’s 35 man detachment of Co. C.

Felhauser, Fehlauser, Fehlfrauer, Fehlhauer, Felhauer, Felhauer,
Felhauser, Felhower or Fellhauser, John C. Pvt. C, D WIA ‘62
WIA NM Campaign. Bugler C
CVCW WIA at La Glorieta, March 28, 1862, NMT listed as John C. Fihlhauser

“Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]
Name: Fehlhauer, John C. or Fehlkauer, John C. Rank: Pvt.
Co.: C, D [reorganised Vet. Bn., 1865]
Enlisted at & date: none given [obviously before March 1862]
Issue: Jan. 8, 1865 Issue: Mar. 7, 1865
Issue: Jun. 2, 1865 Witness: 1SGT J. C. Turner, Co. D
Issue: Sept. 10, 1865 Witness: 1SGT J. C. Turner, Co. D

As John C. Felhauser - “Military Clothing Books Found in the CSA” [CWVR]
Name: Felhauser, John C. Rank: Pvt. Company: C
Enlisted at & date: Sept. 6, 1861 at Hamilton
Issue: Aug. 13, 1862 Witness: 2LT Clark Dunn Issue: Dec. 28, 1864
Remarks: ss John C. Fehlhauer, Settled Dec. 31, 1864
Goodsell, Goodsel, Alvin


Dec. 4, 1864, Dr. Burdsal lists "Albert Goodsell" as WIA from Ft. Lyon.


The wounded are now all doing well, & I shall send some of them to Denver next week. Capt. Talbot is so that he can sit up, some. All the wounded men in hospital will probably recover without the loss of any limbs. Goodsel of Co. H, 1st Regt., is the most injured?, although Maxwell of the 3rd Regt. is still in some danger.

Goodsell, Alvin, Pvt., Co. C, Jan. 14, 1865, died of wounds received Nov. 29, 1864 at Sand Creek in the hospital at Ft. Lyon. [DCF]
Co. C, detachment under 2LT Judson Kennedy at SC and Co. H detachment under 1LT Luther Wilson at SC.

March 18, 2008: observed new headstone “Alvin Goodsell, Co. H, 1 Colo Cav, Jan 14 1865” on the north west side of the Fort Lyon (near Las Animas) National Cemetery. Later checked with the administrator / caretaker and he advised there were no bodies beneath the stones.

Hubbard or Hubburd, Andrew J.

Pvt. C,G SC

Hubbard, William

Pvt., Cpl. C,G

“Editor, National Tribune: At the outbreak of the civil war I was living in Kansas, whence I had removed from Missouri, my native State. Having served three months in the militia, I enlisted in Co. C, 1st Colo. Cav., for three years. [Enlisted at St. Joseph, MO, Co. C, Dec. 16, 1863].

On Dec. 1, 1864, Gen. Cannon [Curtis?] at Fort Leavenworth, ordered Col. Chivington commanding the 1st Colo. Cav., then stationed 25 miles south of Denver [?], to march to Fort Lyon, on the Arkansas River, distant some 225 miles, and disperse a band of Indians, mostly Sioux [?], that had been murdering emigrants and plundering trains.

“.... When we arrived at a point some six miles from the encampment of the hostiles, said to be 900 strong, [about 650-700] Cos. C and G were ordered to move rapidly in advance of the main column and charge them. [C and G were in two different 1st Reg. Bns., Co. G was a battery from Ft. Lyon.] Col. Chivington thought, no doubt, that the appearance of so small a force would not induce the Indians to run away, and that while the two companies were engaging their attention he could make such disposition of his remaining cavalry and the artillery as would enable him to capture or annihilate the entire band.

When we charged the encampment we found the enemy well armed and ready to receive us. After a brief but spirited contest they slowly retreated up Sand Creek, a wide, shallow stream flowing through a level, open country, there being neither trees nor undergrowth to obstruct the view. [o.k.] The retreat was simply a withdrawal to their fortifications. In anticipation of attack, they had dug ditches, an unusual thing for an Indian to do. While retreating to the ditches they fought us stubbornly, sometimes hand to hand. Evidently they were determined to kill and scalp every one of us. Finally they formed in line along the ditches, which were about four feet deep, extending due north and south. We had fought them desperately for about three hours, when we perceived that they were preparing to charge us in turn. [?] Then our situation was almost hopeless. Of the two companies not more than 40 men were in condition to prolong the unequal fight; our ammunition was nearly exhausted, and there was no relief in sight. Luckily, however, Chivington came just in time. [after three hours?] When the eight [four] pieces of artillery opened the surprised and badly scared Indians jumped into the ditches. The enfilading fire of cannon raking the straight ditches from end to end, meant sudden and horrible death to every red warrior who remained in the trenches. The carnage was awful, [yes] hundreds of bad Indians being “in one red burial blent.” Within 10 minutes the artillery ceased firing, and then the cavalry charged the few warriors who fled across the open, sandy plain. Being deprived of their ponies, very few, if any of them escaped. The Sioux Indian rarely surrenders; hence the band on Sand Creek was exterminated. [not] We counted 900 dead Indians. The 1st Colo. Cav. lost about 80 men, killed and wounded [that’s very close to my current figure of 18 KIA or died of wounds and 61 WIA.]

[COMPILER’S ANNOTATION: I’m not sure what to make of this account. It is so far off and so close in the space of a sentence. It’s like two people wrote this thing, one who didn’t know jack and the other who was probably there and because of time sequences may have suffered from the shock of the killings. It’s like maybe some inexperienced or youthful person, trying to fill in for William wrote things like the “wigwams” and the size and shape of the village. I don’t think this is plagiarized but it’s weird. Obviously, the writer got the wrong tribe, the numbers wrong, the
date wrong, but got the distance right, description of the SC valley about right, missing trees right. Maybe someone, who read the literature of the time talked to William about Sand Creek and got some things right and then took license to fill in or make up for whatever William couldn’t effectively articulate. Maybe it was a son or daughter? It could be William was in his seventies by the time this was written, by, with or for him.]

Kennedy, George O.  Pvt.  C
Kennedy, Judson J. Pvt., 8th Cpl., 2nd Sgt., 1SGT, 2LT  D, C, G  SC

J. J. Kennedy [RDB1CO] enlisted as 8th Cpl., at Denver by CPT Downing, October 25, 1861  
Age: 29, b. 1832, in NY, 5’ 9”, dark complex., hazel eyes, black hair

promoted 2nd Sgt., May 1, 1862. Occupation: Miner

Nov. 28-29, 1864: Reports list 2LT Judson J. Kennedy in command of detach. of 35 men Co. C at SC, under 1LT Luther Wilson's Bn. His command took the highest rate of casualties at SC at 13 or 37%.

Denver – *Daily Commonwealth* (May 03, 1864 edition.)

The following promotions were made by His Excellency Gov. Evans, April 29th, 1864.

1st Sergeant J. J. Kennedy, to be 2d Lieut. 1st Cav. Col., vice 2d Lieut. Clark Dunn promoted. 
Date of Commission, April 29, 1864.

May 1, 1864: Commissioned 2LT.

Nov. 20, 1864: 2LT Kennedy and 42 men, Co. C leave Camp Wheeler (at Denver) en route Camp Fillmore. OR lists him at Camp Weld end of October 1864. If they left on Nov.20 then they may have

served as an escort for Chivington and staff who left Denver that date.

Kennedy, Michael  Sgt., Pvt.  C, E, I
Linnell, M. H.  2nd Duty Sgt.  C

Sgt. Linnell listed as a "platoon commander" in 2LT Judson J. Kennedy's report.

Detachment of Co. C under Kennedy at SC.

McBride, Robert E. Pvt. C, G WIA ’64, SC

April 13, 1864: CPT George Sanborn reports, "R. E. McBride has two severe wounds from arrows in the back, one opposite the right lung. Both were extracted." WIA at Fremont's Orchard, April 11, 1864.

April 16, 1864: CPT Sanborn reports, "McBride and the other wounded man [Crosby] of the same company [C] are doing very well, and will soon be around again unless their wounds prove to be worse than they appear."

About 31 YOA at time of Sand Creek.

The Trail, July 1909, “Robert E. McBride, who died on June 20th at the age of 76, one of the fast decreasing ‘59ers, was a veteran of the Colorado First Cavalry, Company C, enlisting in the regiment in ’61, at Buckskin Joe, ... he served in the New Mexico campaign, Glorieta and Apache Canon, , “all the important Indian engagements including that of the Sand Creek massacre.”

“Robert E. McBride died June 20, 1909, at the age of 76, one of the fast-decreasing ‘59ers. He was a veteran of the Colorado 1st Cavalry, Co. E. [?] enlisting in the regiment at Buckskin Joe, one of the most prosperous mining camps in Colorado at that time, situated on the west side of South Park near the town of Alma.

He served in the New Mexican campaign of 1862 and figured in all the engagements, including that of Glorieta, Arapahoe [Apache Cañon?], etc. He was in the Sand Creek massacre. In 1864 he was severely wounded in the battle of Fremont’s Orchard. An Indian engagement between here and Ft. Morgan. He spent most of his life in Colorado prospecting.” [RPC]

Riverside Cemetery, Denver, Colorado, Saturday, January 17, 2009

Robt. E. McBride, Co. C, 1 Colo. Cav., original stone

Mettge or Mettze, August Pvt. C WIA/DIS/SC, Died Dec. 17


RMN, Dec. 28, 1864 ed. prints Dec. 10, 1864 letter from soldiers recuperating at Ft. Lyon Hospital. One signed as "A. Mettgo, Co. F, 1st Cavalry."

Mettage, [or Mettze], August, Pvt., Co. C, Dec. 17, 1864, died of wounds received in action, Nov. 29, 1864 at Sand Creek. [DCF]

August Mettige, enlisted Jan. 25, 1862 [RDB1CO] Age: 22, b. 1839, in Germany, 5' 2 ¼", blue eyes, light hair, fair complx. Occupation: Gunsmith

"August Metz, of Blake Street bridge, who was carried along with the torrent eighteen miles to Henderson's Island, is the only person found who we have yet heard of." From Goldrick's account of the flood of May 19, 1864 appearing in the Commonwealth on May 24/25, 1864. [FHY] In Commonwealth, June 01, Metz still not heard from.

Pierson, Oliver Pvt. C KIA/SC

KIA SC under 2LT Judson J. Kennedy's command. Kennedy describes him as "mortally wounded" and dying later. CSA lists Pierson as DIS. Monument in front – west side – of State Capitol Building, 1st Reg. Decedents – 1864, Pvt. Oliver Pierson. RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that Oliver C. Pierson, Co. C, was wounded, in right leg with arrow. RMN, Dec. 12, 1864 ed., reports letter dated Nov. 29, 1864 received from "M" detailing events at Ft. Lyon from the 29th to Dec. 03, 1864. "M" attaches a letter from Dr. Caleb Burdsal listing Dec. 4, 1864 killed and wounded. Oliver Pierson, Co. C, 1st Reg. listed as killed. Buried at Fort Lyon.

Safely, Alexander F. (Fenwick) Pvt., Scout C, H SC

DOB: June 30, 1841, [Waterford, NY] buried Green Mountain Cemetery, Boulder County, CO.

Testified before the Military Commission, Denver, May 19, 1865. Described his duties as Scout for the Indian Expedition. Stated he'd been with the 1st Reg. for 3.5 years [actually almost 4 years].

[RDB1CO] A. F. Safely, enlisted as Pvt. Sept. 25, 1861, Age: 20. 5’ 10”, light complx, black hair, black eyes

Oct. 22, 1864: Orders from COL Shoup indicate he performed as a Scout to the Republican R. Testified he was one of the first on the battle ground at SC. With Co. H, 1st Reg. Shot White Antelope in groin. 23 YOA at time of Sand Creek.


Alex. Safely of Co. “C” having been commissioned by His Excellency the Actg. Gov. of Colorado [Samuel Hitt Elbert] as a 2nd Lieut. vice Cramer [1LT Joseph A. Cramer] promoted, but not having received his discharge and been mustered in as a Commissioned Officer, in
consideration of the scarcity of Officers, is hereby assigned to duty as Actg. 2nd Lieut. Co. “D” and will without delay proceed to Denver City and report to the Commander of that Co. for duty.

By order of Major E. W. Wynkoop, Vet. Batt. 1st Colo. Cavalry, Commanding


Leadville D. *Chronicle*, Feb. 13, 1879, p1, c1, Claim Alexander Safely was scout, not Autobras, DPL/WHC catalogue.


South, Elias
Pvt., Saddler
C, G
WIA/SC

Tabor, Gus
Pvt.
C
KIA/SC

RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that Gus Tabor, Pvt. Co. C, 1st Reg. was killed. Name does not appear on monument, does not appear in rosters.

Turner, John C.
Pvt., 1SGT
C, D
SC

John Charles Turner, Aka: Jack

Turner listed as "platoon commander" at SC in 2LT Judson J. Kennedy's report.

33 YOA at time of Sand Creek. Assigned to Co. C, 1st Reg.

Assigned to Co. D in reorganized Veteran Bn., 1st Reg. Cav., Colo. Vols. in early 1865

John C. Turner, b. Worcestershire Co., England [RDB1CO] [Appears to be in contradiction to CFTH below showing him b. in CT.]


In Denver. “After dinner I hunted up the Dr. and he told me to report to the Adg’t Gen’l. I did so and he ordered me to report to Lieut’ Willson [Luther Wilson] “He ordered me to report to Sergeant Turner and he showed me a tent where I could sleep.” [ROD]
John and Emma (Stevens) Turner - John Charles Turner, known as Jack

b. March 10, 1831, Connecticut

d. May 20, 1902, after fall from hay wagon, buried in old Animas City Cem. at Durango

came to Denver June 20, 1858 with Lawrence party

original member of Auraria Town Co.

“He joined the famous Baker party in exploring the mountainous area of SW Colo; when the Civil War broke out in 1861 they were camped at the site known as Baker’s Ridge about 18 miles N of present day Durango. Baker being a southerner left for the south with the other southern sympathizers. Jack and the remainder of the party returned to Denver where he joined the 1st Colo. Cav. [Inf.], was a Sgt. in Co. C and served under Col. J. M. Chivington.

After war became sheriff of Colfax Co. NMT, became personal friend of Gov. Lew Wallace

March 10, 1876 settled on 160 acres on E side of Animas R. about 5 mi. N of Durango.

Became sheriff of La Plata Co..

[Weston, Pugh] Pvt. C WIA/SC

RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that Pugh Weston, Pvt. Co. C, was wounded, slight wound in hip. Not listed on rosters.

Possible: Wilson, Pud. unknown rank and company, identified in TRUE as wounded, “shot through the abdomen” at the same time as CPT Talbott at SC. Pud reportedly recovered. Co. C was LT Judson Kennedy’s detachment and took significant casualties.

[Wheatley, Augustus] Pvt. C WIA/SC

RMN, Dec. 08, 1864 reports from list of casualties generated on or about Nov. 29, 1864 that Augustus Wheatley, Pvt. Co. C, was wounded, in neck with arrow, slight. Not in rosters.
APPENDIX B

Forensic Ballistics Analysis

By
Douglas D. Scott, Ph.D
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target #</th>
<th>Gun Type</th>
<th>Nom. Cal.</th>
<th>Dia/In.</th>
<th>Wt/Grms</th>
<th>Wt/Grains</th>
<th>Lands &amp; Grooves</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>.36 Colt</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.364</td>
<td>5.75</td>
<td>89.4</td>
<td>7 left</td>
<td>Typical cast ball, probably Colt Navy M1851, low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>.44 Henry</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.422</td>
<td>12.7</td>
<td>195.8</td>
<td>6 right</td>
<td>.44-caliber Henry flat nose, low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>.44 Henry</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>.44-caliber rimfire Henry cartridge case with double firing pin mark typical of Henry rifle, no headstamp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>1873 Colt</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.448</td>
<td>15.8</td>
<td>244.5</td>
<td>7 left</td>
<td>.45-caliber Colt M1873-type bullet, could easily post-date 1873, type used until 1900s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>.54 Minie</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.549</td>
<td>24.15</td>
<td>371.8</td>
<td>3 right</td>
<td>.54-caliber Minie ball with strong ramrod mark, likely dirty gun-M1841 Mississippi Rifle, low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>.44 Sharps</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.416</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>229.6</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>Mushroomed high velocity impact, 2-ring Sharps variety, could be 1864 or later</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>.58 Minie</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>0.593</td>
<td>30.25</td>
<td>467.7</td>
<td>3 right</td>
<td>.58-caliber Minie ball, low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>.54 Starr</td>
<td>0.54</td>
<td>0.567</td>
<td>28.85</td>
<td>447.5</td>
<td>Not fired</td>
<td>.54-caliber Starr bullet with strong pressing lines from manufacture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>.52 Sharps</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>27.2</td>
<td>420.8</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>.52-caliber Sharps variant 2 ring type, medium to high velocity impact on side, likely ricochet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>.44 Sharps</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.428</td>
<td>18.6</td>
<td>286.3</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>.44-caliber Sharps variant 2 ring type, long body (.44), low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>.44 Sharps</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.436</td>
<td>18.55</td>
<td>286.7</td>
<td>6 right</td>
<td>.44-caliber Sharps variant 2 ring type, long body (.44), low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>.58 Minie</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>*</td>
<td>25.45</td>
<td>391.6</td>
<td>3 right</td>
<td>.58-caliber Minie ball, high velocity impact on side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>.52 Sharps</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.544</td>
<td>27.7</td>
<td>437.2</td>
<td>3 right</td>
<td>.52-caliber Sharps 2 ring variety, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>.44 Ballard</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>.44-caliber rimfire cartridge case, block firing pin imprint consistent with a Ballard, H (Winchester) headstamp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>.44 Sharps</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.413</td>
<td>13.35</td>
<td>205.6</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>.44-caliber Sharps variant 2 ring type, high velocity impact on side, likely ricochet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>.36 Savage</td>
<td>0.36</td>
<td>0.349</td>
<td>10.35</td>
<td>159.6</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>.36-caliber bullet of type meant for Savage revolver, wide tie ring type, lands and grooves could be Colt, but not clear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>1873 Colt</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.466</td>
<td>16.35</td>
<td>251.9</td>
<td>7 left</td>
<td>.45-caliber M1873 type bullet, could easily post-date 1873, type used until 1900s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>.52 Sharps</td>
<td>0.52</td>
<td>0.536</td>
<td>28.4</td>
<td>439.7</td>
<td>Not discernable</td>
<td>.52-caliber Sharps 2 ring variety, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Not measurable
APPENDIX C
List of All Collected Artifacts
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Northing</th>
<th>Easting</th>
<th>Area</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>4272162</td>
<td>716087</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Round ball, fired/flattened; 50 cal. 12 grams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>4272609</td>
<td>716079</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Iron arrow point</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>4272166</td>
<td>716044</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>.36 cal. Model 1851 Colt Navy pistol ball, 5.75 grams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>4272380</td>
<td>716055</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Spur, Model 1859 military; bent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>4273121</td>
<td>716034</td>
<td>A</td>
<td>Lithic: igneous pebble with hole in it; possible medicine stone or amulet, possibly assoc. w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>4272008</td>
<td>715965</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Copper belt buckle, early 20th c.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>4272824</td>
<td>715874</td>
<td>isolate</td>
<td>.44 Henry flat nose bullet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>4272951</td>
<td>715831</td>
<td>isolate</td>
<td>Drift punch or spike, modified for use as a chisel; possibly assoc. w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>4272155</td>
<td>715803</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.44 cal. Henry rimfire cartridge case w/double firing pin mark typical of Henry rifle, no headstamp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>4272725</td>
<td>715778</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>.45 cal. 1873 Colt bullet, type used until 1900s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>4272524</td>
<td>715783</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Waist cinch buckle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>4272354</td>
<td>715782</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.54 cal. Minie bullet, 14.15 grams, ramrod mark; fired from M 1841 Mississippi rifle; rifle was likely dirty; low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>4272309</td>
<td>715744</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Archaic Period projectile point, modified for use as a scraper</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>4272603</td>
<td>715472</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>rifle ball, fired; .51 cal., 13 grams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>4272133</td>
<td>715866</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Tobacco pouch tag; post-1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>4272227</td>
<td>715754</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.52 cal. Sharps bullet, 2-ring variety, 15 grams; mushroomed high velocity impact; could be circa 1864 or later</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>4272303</td>
<td>715764</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Spoon imbedded in melted white metal; late 19th-early 20th c.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>4272312</td>
<td>715760</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>Tobacco pouch tag; post-1870</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>4272309</td>
<td>715752</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.58 cal. Minie ball, low velocity impact</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>4272314</td>
<td>715726</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>Rifle or pistol ball, fired/flattened; .47 cal., 10 grams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>4272260</td>
<td>715698</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.54 cal. Starr bullet w/ strong pressing lines from manufacture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>4272336</td>
<td>715741</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.41 caliber pistol bullet, fired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>4272415</td>
<td>715686</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.52 cal. Sharps bullet, variant 2-ring type, 27.2 grams, medium to high velocity, impact on side, likely ricochet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>4272399</td>
<td>715709</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.41 cal. round ball, dropped/unfired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>4272589</td>
<td>715703</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.44 cal. Sharps bullet, variant 2-ring type, 18.6 grams, long body, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>4272648</td>
<td>715678</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.44 cal. Sharps bullet, variant 2-ring type, 18.6 grams, long body, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>4272414</td>
<td>715463</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.58 cal. Minie ball, high velocity impact on side</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>4272364</td>
<td>715299</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.52 cal. Sharps bullet, 2-ring variety, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>4272370</td>
<td>715281</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Awl, iron, 6.0” long</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>4272372</td>
<td>715283</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>.44 cal. Ballard rimfire cartridge case, block firing pin imprint consistent with a Ballard, H (Winchester) head stamp</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>4272374</td>
<td>715282</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Cut nail, 2.5” long; may be assoc. w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>4272374</td>
<td>715282</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Cut nail, 2.0” long; may be assoc.w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>4272376</td>
<td>715279</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Rivet head, brass; shaft broken off</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>4272376</td>
<td>715275</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Brass adjustment knob; may be assoc. w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38</td>
<td>4272387</td>
<td>715287</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Iron kettle fragment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39</td>
<td>4272466</td>
<td>715429</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>Horseshoe nail tip; may be assoc. w/ massacre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>40</td>
<td>4272450</td>
<td>715434</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>4-hole pressed iron button</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>41</td>
<td>4272468</td>
<td>715433</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Round ball, fired/flattened; .53 cal. 15 grams</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>42</td>
<td>4272464</td>
<td>715442</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>.32 cal. round ball, dropped/unfired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43</td>
<td>4272468</td>
<td>715447</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>.44 cal. Sharps variant 2-ring type bullet, high velocity impact on side, likely ricochet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>44</td>
<td>4272481</td>
<td>715455</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>.36 cal. bullet of a type meant for Savage revolver, wide tie ring type, lands and grooves could be a Colt, but not clear</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45</td>
<td>4272582</td>
<td>715466</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>.45 cal. Colt Model 1873 bullet, could post-date 1873, type used until 1900s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>46</td>
<td>4272416</td>
<td>715425</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>Percussion cap, fired</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>47</td>
<td>4271938</td>
<td>715905</td>
<td>isolate</td>
<td>.52 cal. Sharps bullet, 2-ring variety, low impact velocity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48</td>
<td>4272234</td>
<td>715843</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>.52 cal. round ball, fired</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
APPENDIX D
Figures 5-12
Figure 5: Metal detection survey along both sides of the unnamed drainage, center. View north.

Figure 6: Excavation of a target.
Figure 7: Survey within Area B, using 5 meter-spacing transects. View east.

Figure 8: Area D, artifacts marked with pin flags. Tree line demarcates Sand Creek; approximate eastern end of the southern bank “sand pits” area is in upper left of photo. View west.
Figure 9: a (T12) .44 Henry cartridge case; b (T46) percussion cap; c (T37) adjustment knob; d (T6) .36 Colt Navy M1851; e (T22) .58 Minié ball; f (T15) .54 Minié ball with ramrod mark; g (T24) .54 Starr; h (T31) .52 Sharps; i (T29) .44 Sharps, long body; j (T10) .44 Henry, flat nose variant.
Figure 10: k (T 7) M1859 spur; l (T 14) waist cinch buckle; m (T 40) suspender button.
Figure 11: n (T 38) kettle fragment; o (T 32) awl; p (T 8) possible medicine stone; q (T 3) arrow point.
Figure 12: r (T 9) early twentieth century belt buckle; s (T 11) drift punch or spike, with modified tip for use as a chisel.